



Project:	Silverton Wind Farm
Meeting No:	18
Date:	Thursday 28 July 2016
Venue and Time:	Silverton Youth Hall, 6pm – 8pm
Document:	Meeting minutes and actions
Chair/Facilitator:	Kath Elliott (KE)
Minutes:	Helena (HO), AGL
AGL representatives:	Helena Orel (HO) Community Stakeholder Engagement Manager Adam Mackett (AGM) Manager, Project Management Office
Committee Members	Cynthia Langford, Purnamoota Station
	Phillip Blore, Belmont Station
	Albert Woodroffe, Silverton Committee, Horizon Galleries
	Peter Price Silverton Village Committee / Silverton Hotel
	Luke Norley, alternate for Steve Radford, Consolidated Mining and Civil
	John Taplin, Secretary Silverton Village Committee
	Dave Gallagher, Regional Development Australia
	Kevin White, Historic Daydream Mine
	Glenn Coinez, Silver City Minerals
	Marion Browne, Broken Hill City Council
	Helen Murray, local resident
	Naomi Schmidt, Eldee Station
	Rod Grenfell, local resident
Guests	
Apologies	Ray O'Donnell, Broken Hill Local Aboriginal Land Council
	Broken Hill Chamber of Commerce
Community observers in attendance:	Approximately 35, including media representatives



Meeting Minutes

Item	Action
<p>1. Welcome</p> <p>KE opened the meeting at 6.00pm and welcomed the group, members of the Silverton Community Consultative Committee, observers and media representatives. KE introduced Dave Gallagher who is representing Regional Development Australia on the CCC, and also introduced guests Broken Hill City Council General Manager James Roncon, Councillor Jim Nolan and Mayor Wincen Cuy.</p> <p>KE asked if the group if AGL was able to take photos of the meeting and if anyone didn't want their photo taken to let it be known. One person stated they didn't want their photo taken. AGL agreed that person would not be included in the photos.</p> <p>KE noted that representatives from the media were present. KE advised the media their would be no filming. However, interviews could be conducted separately and reiterated the standing CCC agreement that community members when speaking with the media were to only speak on their own behalf.</p> <p>KE provided an overview of the agenda.</p> <p>The minutes from the April 2016 meeting were discussed. The minutes were accepted as correct, with no matters arising.</p> <p>HO went through the actions from the April CCC meeting.</p>	
<p>2. Project status update, Adam Mackett (AGL)</p> <p><i>See presentation slides 5 - 19</i></p> <p>AGM gave an overview of the current project proposal and a brief update on the project background for the benefit of newcomers to the meeting. He explained that the wind farm size is now likely to be around 200 MW with about 60 – 70 turbines (of the originally proposed 282 from the Project Approval) each with a capacity of 3+MWs. Over the past 4.5 years, there has been advances in turbine technology. The new larger turbine technology will capture more wind, generate more energy and result in a more efficient wind farm. The reduced wind turbine numbers will all result in a smaller environmental footprint.</p> <p>Two tenderers have been recently shortlisted and we have commenced contractually negotiations in relation to the design, construction and commissioning of the wind farm. Negotiations are expected to take a couple of months. AGL is aiming to confirm the preferred construction tenderer around October 2016.</p> <p>AGM advised that the Application to Connect process with TransGrid (connecting to the project's 220 kV transmission line to electrical grid system) was also being progressed in parallel.</p> <p>Modification 3 Project Approval Amendment exhibition</p> <p>AGM noted that AGL had been busy over the past months preparing information for Modification 3 to the Project Approval. AGM explained that Modification 3 contained information about increases in wind turbine turbine dimensions (tip height and rotor diameter) together with a significant reduction in wind turbine numbers. Stage 1 turbine numbers (Project Approval) would be reduced from 282 to 172 (reduction of 110 turbines) and Stage 2 (Concept</p>	

Approval) would be surrendered (reduction of 316 turbines). The larger MW turbine capacity meant that the 426 wind turbine locations were no longer required.

AGL has submitted Modification 3 to the Dept of Planning and Environment (DPE) for an 'adequacy review' before it goes on public exhibition. AGL explained the process for the upcoming public exhibition period during August for Modification 3. The Modification 3 documentation would be displayed at the Silverton Hotel, Broken Hill City Council and Wentworth Shire Council. Additionally, a notice was placed on the notice board behind the Youth Hall referring people to the Silverton Hotel. The notice board was not large enough to display the document. HO handed out copies of the Modification 3 document for the CCC to use during the CCC presentation and noted that there were three copies for those at the meeting who don't have access to computers. HO explained that additional copies would be at the Silverton Hotel, and the DPE website link would be distributed to the CCC group and the wider community. Community members could request a copy of the document sent to them.

Powering Australian Renewables Fund (PARF)

AGM explained that subject to approval, the Silverton Wind Farm may be the first greenfield project developed by the PARF. On 27 July 2016, AGL announced the PARF equity partners: AGL, QIC Global Infrastructure Fund and Future Fund. The PARF is targeting around 1,000 MW of large scale renewable energy investment which would result in an investment of approx \$2-3 billion.

Modification 2 update

AGM advised that the Modification 2 submissions report had been issued to DPE on 14 April 2016. This modification was seeking an extension to the Project Approval.

Q1. Will the substation have the capacity to handle the larger capacity turbines? Will it need upgrading?

A1. AGM advised that the substation will require a new bay and two circuit breakers and together with the 220 kV transmission line would be designed for the proposed 200 MW installed capacity.

Q2. Will the substation take all 172 turbines if installed in the future, or will it just take the 60 turbines proposed for now?

A2. AGM noted that the substation would be design for the proposed 200 MW capacity with the additional wind turbines providing an option for future demand growth and transmission developments in the area.

AGM went through the slides demonstrating that three closest wind turbines to Silverton in the approved project were now planned to be removed as part of Modification 3 in consideration of the community's feedback.

Q3. HM asked how close were the turbines to her property boundary?

A3. AGM said this information was detailed in the Modification 3 report.

The group looked through the report and found the turbine distances to various properties in the area.

Q4. Will the larger turbines make more noise?

A4. AGM explained that a noise assessment had been undertaken and this detail was in the Modification 3 report and that changes in sound characteristics would likely to be balanced out by reduced numbers of turbines.

Q5. Are the new turbines in use anywhere in Australia?

A5. AGM noted that the technology is still evolving and the wind turbines being considered were not currently installed in Australia.

Q6. Do the larger turbines turn more slowly?

A6. AGM explained they turn at a similar rotation to the smaller turbines.

Q7. Is turbulence greater with larger turbines?

A7. AGM explained larger blades, can create more wake area.

Q8. Is there landscaping requirements for people closer than 6km to a turbine?

A8. AGM noted that AGL will work with affected community members to minimise visual impacts and to develop landscaping plans accordingly.

Q9. What trees can you plant to hide such tall turbines?

A9. The types of trees depend on a number of factors including soil and climate and what the resident neighbour wants to plant.

Q10. Will AGL plant advanced trees?

A10. AGM noted that the planting would be done in consultation with the resident/neighbour and ecologists to get the best outcomes for screening planting.

Q11. Has AGL calculated how many wedge tailed eagles would be harmed by larger turbines?

A11. AGM explained that with less turbines, the rotor swept area would be reduced and the updated bird and bat assessment is included in Modification 3.

Q12. How does the wind farm compare to Macarthur Wind Farm in terms of bird impacts?

A12. Each area is different given the local flora and fauna and the bird and bat assessments are specific to the area.

Q13. What is the highest decibel output for a turbine?

A13. AGM answered it is approximately 106 dB(A)

Q14. What is the noise levels for Eldee Station?

A14. AGM answered it is approximately 30-32 dba which is captured in the Modification 3 report.

Q15. KW asked how many turbines will be visible from Daydream mine?

A15. AGM explained that the Modification 3 report include assessment of the different viewpoints, including the Daydream Mine. AGM noted that the turbines on the NE ridge would be visible from the mine.

AGM discussed the bat and avifauna monitoring and how it is addressed in Mod 3 and the Species Risk Assessment.

There was discussion around aviation lighting requirements and AGM confirmed that AGL had consulted with CASA on turbine lighting requirements. CASA confirmed that turbine lighting was not required for Silverton turbines.

AGM advised that in consultation with Essential Water, AGL was aiming to source water from the Stephen's Creek to Umberumberka Reservoir pipeline.

AGM went through the project photomontage images and there was general discussion around the images. Images showed before and after scenarios for turbine numbers and locations. High quality images are included in the Modification 3 report.

AGM described the Barrier Range Dragon's origins and its taxonomic assessment. Confirmed that AGL will follow all mitigation measures as specified for Barrier Range Dragon, including buffer zones around dragon habitat areas.

Q16. Isn't AGL responsible for registering the Dragon Federally?

A16. AGM explained that Mod 3 has significant management requirements in place, established wind farm tracks will further protect the Dragon's habitat as vehicles will stay on the designated tracks.

AGM explained erosion mitigation plans for the construction process

Topics of interest raised post April CCC

Presentation slides 20 - 24

AGM explained how the Environmental Assessment and Statement of Commitment requires Sediment and Erosion Control Plan to minimise deterioration of water quality. Soil and water management practices will be guided by best practice guidelines within Soils and Construction Vol.1 (Landcom 2004). This will form part of the Water Management Plan for the Construction Environmental Management Plan (CEMP), which requires NSW Office of Water and Director General approval.

Q17. Epuron proposed haybales as erosion control, what is AGL proposing?

A17. Haybales and silt fences provide temporary control, however, the drainage design will include treatment treatment which will be included in the Water Management Plan for the CEMP.

Q18. Do the turbines draw energy from the grid when they are not turning?

A18. There is a draw when they are idle, but it is very low.

Q19. Is there a new senate inquiry into renewable energy and certificates in South Australia?

A19. A Council Of Australian Governments (COAG) meeting has been called by Minister Frydenberg to look at the energy sector overall and this may include discussion about the recent senate inquiry into wind turbines.

AGM went through the Delabole Wind Farm, North Cornwall, UK which was established on a horse stud by the owners of the horse stud. It has recently upgraded its turbines to a larger capacity turbines. There have been no reported issues with the horses relating to the wind farm/turbines.

General discussion around high performance horses and turbine impacts, but there was no clarity about where and when high performance horses had been impacted by turbines.

Q20. What impact is there on high performance horses as they are very skittish?

A20. HO advised there is little information available on horses and wind farms and the Delabole Wind Farm is good example of performance horses existing in harmony with wind farms. However, AGL would carry out further research.

Q21. What will the transmission line design look like?

A21. AGM advised it will be a single pole design and not the tradition larger 'lattice' style towers. This will greatly reduce visual impacts.

AGL will take photos from the desert sculpture park and will create a photo montage of the proposed layout to be constructed.

Q22. We notice AGL has had multiple project extensions, if significant work does not start within the next two years, will you be seeking another extension?

A22. AGL is working very hard to get this project to construction as soon as possible.

Q23. Will the successful contractor be decided on, by their local input commitments?

A23. Based on experience with the solar plant, we have confidence in local contractors being able to support the wind farm's construction and we have local industry participation requirements included in the tender contracts.

HO advised that industry briefings would be held once the successful contractor was confirmed and project financing finalised. These briefings would be advertised to all.

Q24. Why do other companies such as mines have to bring landscape to its original state and AGL doesn't?

A24. At the end of the wind farm's guaranteed life, if AGL determines to not repower the wind farm, then AGL will have to fully remediate the site. This is a requirement in the project approval which would be part of the decommissioning plan.

Q25. Is AGL required to pay Dept Planning and Environment or Crown Lands

A25. AGL will begin making payments to Crown Lands as part of the lease agreement with Crown Lands upon execution of the lease. The most significant payments are triggered by construction.

Q26. How much will AGL pay me per turbine that I include in my paintings?

A26. There will be benefits from having the wind farm in the area, including tourism and artist elements.

Q27. Information signs at Hallett Wind Farm say that 42 people are employed at the Hallett Wind Farms, are they all local?

A27. The majority live in the area and having employment on the wind farm has enabled some of them to relocate back to their home areas with their families.

HO to further investigate information about wind farms and high performance horses

HO to investigate photos and photo montage.

Q28. Is AGL declaring conflicts of interest?

A28. HO advised that AGL no longer makes political donations and previous political donations are included in the Modification 3 report.

Q29. Will you sell the wind farm and continue to operate it, and are reinstatement requirements passed onto the new owner?

A29. We are currently developing the Silverton wind farm as the first greenfield developed for the PARF. AGL is an equity partner in the PARF and will maintain management responsibilities, including operation and reinstatement.

Q30. Is the Broken Hill Solar Plant being sold?

A30. The Broken Hill Solar Plant together with the Nyngan Solar Plant solar plant are intended to provide 'seed' assets for the Powering Australian Renewable Fund (PARF).. AGL will continue to operate and maintain the solar plants and ensure their good working order.

NSW CCC draft Guidelines

HO provided an overview of the current arrangements where AGL engages and pays for an independent chairperson to chair the CCC meetings. Noted that this is fairly common practice across many projects.

HO advised that between February and May 2016, the NSW Government had put CCC draft guidelines on public exhibition and that AGL had made a submission on the draft guidelines. HO noted that there had been no further information released from NSW Govt about the draft guidelines to date and it appears that final guidelines had not been released yet.

http://planspolicies.planning.nsw.gov.au/index.pl?action=view_job&job_id=7381

3. CCC membership review update

See presentation slides 27- 28

HO gave an overview of the review the project's CCC membership, after contacting all current members to discuss their intentions for upcoming CCC meetings. After consultation with the community, no CCC members had resigned or left the group. However, there was still a confirmation of membership to be confirmed by the Broken Hill Chamber of Commerce.

HO explained the updated list of CCC members, and that David Gallagher was no longer Council's alternative member to Councillor Marion Brown, but would be representing Regional Development Australia. Glenn Coinez would be replacing Cameron Koch for Silver City Minerals.

It was reiterated that a CCC member should resign from the committee if they have missed three consecutive meetings without sending an alternative as was agreed at the previous CCC meeting. The Chair would contact the non attendee to discuss the matter before discussing resignation options.

<p><i>Post meeting notes:</i></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <i>The Broken Hill Aboriginal Land Council confirmed that Ray Donald would be replaced by Maureen O'Donnell and Joanne O'Donnell as alternative to Maureen.</i> <i>Councillor James Nolan confirmed he is the alternative for Councillor Marion Browne.</i> <p>CCC group visit to Silverton Wind Farm site</p> <p>HO explained that following the request from the group for a site visit AGL had been investigating the best way to implement the request. Due to accessibility issues and the difficult terrain, it had taken some time to work out the best way to get the group up on to the site to a location where they could view Silverton from the turbine locations closer to Silverton.</p> <p>HO explained that due to having to limit numbers because smaller vehicles only can access the tracks in their current state, the visit would be done in two stages, one for Silverton members and one for Council representatives.</p> <p>HO asked for a show of hands as to who wanted to participate in the visit: Peter and Patsy Price, Albert Woodroff, Helen Murray, Bob Watson, John and Joan Bennet, Derek Wyness will do the first visit. Helena will be in contact again to discuss further details with the eight participants. HO will follow up with the Council to implement their site visit.</p> <p>It was discussed that visit will coincide with the next CCC meeting.</p>	<p>HO to progress field trip for the CCC group and Broken Hill Council</p>
<p>4. Other business</p> <p>No matters raised for other business</p>	
<p>4. Next meeting and close</p> <p>There was discussion amongst the group about the next meeting date. It was agreed by general group consensus that the meeting would be held in about two months time, but that it was not be held during school holidays for NSW and SA, which are very busy time for the Silverton community.</p> <p>It was agreed that AGL would propose a meeting date for around mid October.</p> <p><i>Post meeting note</i></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <i>AGL proposed the next CCC meeting for Thursday 20 October. The CCC group was advised by email of the proposal. No feedback received from the group regarding the date or meeting time.</i> <p>The meeting will from 6pm to 8pm at the Silverton Youth Hall. Meeting closed at 8.25pm.</p>	<p>AGL to confirm next meeting date with CCC group and interested community members</p>

Action Item	CCC meeting	Status	Who
Speak to the media on behalf of the members before CCC meetings on the protocols of interviewing and quoting members in articles.	October 2013	Ongoing	KE
Send out hard copies of TMP once it has been finalised with preferred tender.	March 2014	Open	HO
Draft letter from the CCC about the project and turbine setbacks to the Director General and the Minister for Planning	July 2015	Open	KE
AGL to advise the CCC when Modification 3 goes on public exhibition.	April 2016	Closed	HO
Include the CCC membership discussion with minutes and CCC members attending meetings infrequently to be contacted.	April 2016	Closed	HO
AGL to progress photomontage from the desert sculpture park of the proposed layout to be constructed.	July 2016	Open	HO
AGL to further investigate information about wind farms and high performance horses	April 2016	Open	HO
AGL to progress field trip for the CCC group and Broken Hill Council	April 2016	Open	HO
AGL to liaise with PP (Silverton Village Committee) regarding use the of the empty butcher shop.	April 2016	Closed	HO
AGL to confirm next meeting date with CCC group and interested community members	April 2016	Closed	HO